

“Twin one, twin too”

What does it mean to be a twin? A psychoanalytic investigation into the phenomenon of twins.

By

Emer Mc Cormack

The thesis is submitted to the Quality and Qualifications Ireland (QQI) for the degree of MA in Psychoanalytic Psychotherapy from Dublin Business School, School of Arts.

Supervisor: Dr. Gráinne Donohue

Submitted: July 2015

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	4
ABSTRACT	6
<u>CHAPTER ONE</u>	7
<i>Twin mythology</i>	
Twin mythology & identity	9
Twinship	11
<u>CHAPTER TWO</u>	13
<i>(Identity formation) Jacques Lacan and Melanie Klein</i>	
Jacques Lacan The mirror stage	
Jacques Lacan: The family complexes: intrusion.	
Melanie Klein: Depressive position & schizoid mechanism	
<u>CHAPTER THREE</u>	23
<i>Identity formation in twins</i>	
Melanie Klein	23
Dorothy Burlingham	25
Anna Freud & Dorothy Burlingham: Hampstead Nursery's.	27
Alessandra Piontelli	28
Sigmund Freud	30
Wilfred Bion	31
Death of a twin	
<u>CHAPTER FOUR</u>	34
<i>Conclusion</i>	
BIBLOGRAPHY	38

Acknowledgements

This thesis would not have been possible without the love and support of a number of incredibly special people. First and foremost, I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisor Grainne Donohue, whose expertise, understanding and patience, added considerably to my experience of writing this piece of research.

A very special thank you to my class mates Laura- Mai, Hugh, Valerija, Mary and Simona “we have made it” it has been a pleasure working alongside you all over the last three years a beautiful friendship has developed between us so here’s to our further plans together.

I must also acknowledge some of my very dear friends Jamie, Davina and Rachel you have all been absolute rocks to me over the last few years. Thank you so much for all your friendship, encouragement and unyielding support.

Most importantly, I would also like to thank my Family Mam, Dad, Thomas and Michael for their support , love and understanding that they have provided me throughout my entire life and in particular my boyfriend Alan without your love , encouragement, endless patience and editing assistance, I would not have finished this thesis.

Tweedledum and Tweedledee
Agree to have a battle;
For Tweedledum said Tweedledee
Had spoiled his nice new rattle.
Just then flew a monstrous
Crow,
As black as a tar-barrel;
Which frightened both the heroes so,
They quite forgot their quarrel.

Lewis Carroll (1871)¹ “through the looking glass”

¹ Carroll, L. (1871) through the looking glass. The sequel to: Alice’s adventures in wonderland. Macmillian.UK.

Abstract

In the context of this thesis, the author will explain “identity” focusing on two theories from Jacques Lacan’s “Mirror Stage” and Melanie Klein’s “paranoid schizoid and depressive position”, in an attempt to understand what it means for a single individual and how they form their identity. Outlying similarities and differences in how identity is conceptualised within these perspectives and discussing the clinical implications. The author will then apply this to twin studies and observations exploring the consequences and gains that can occur in relation to each child in the twin ship, therefore, answering the proposed question of what does it mean to be a twin from a psychoanalytic perspective. It will focus on the question of how the twins form their own identity when another is always present. The study will also discuss the impact of the death of a twin and the implications for twins whom are in analysis. The piece of research will then conclude, reflecting back on the previous chapters putting forward questions and recommendations for further research.

Chapter One

Introduction

Twin mythology

Twins, especially identical twins for thousands of years have awed and fascinated many. Myths and legends give us an understanding of the twinning processes in that they help to give an understanding of twins and highlight the twinning process. “Myths and stories we create to express, and to understand and resolve, unconscious processes and conflicts. They represent universal phantasies and can be analysed like dreams” (Lewin, 2014.p.28). Freud (1913) described fairy tales and myths as a product of ethnic imagination. Myths are symbolic representation of our experience as they move psychically from the more concrete objects of the paranoid-schizoid position towards the depressive position (Lewin, 2014.p.29). Splitting and the creation of a ‘double’ is central to this and the creation of these mythical twins is escalated in the process seen in twinning. Twins in mythology emphasise two different twin relationships; jealousy and hatred in Jacob and Esau and a loving bond unable to live apart such as that seen in Castor and Polydeuces. Castor and Polydeuces were twins who were bound by a love that removed any rivalry between them. They were born to Leda after Zeus, the king of gods seduced her while disguised as a swan. Leda had also been conceived by her husband Tyndareus and she gave birth to four children. Castor was mortal and Polydeuces, a god; they were inseparable. They were both known for their athletic abilities, Castor as a breaker of horses and Polydeuces as a master boxer but unfortunately Castor was killed during battle and Polydeuces prayed to Zeus that he should not outlive his brother (Graves, 1992:248). As he refused to accept immortality unless Castor shared it with him, Zeus allowed them to remain together and both were carried up to heaven. He then set their images among the stars as the twins Gemini.

These were twin’s inseparable even in death an enmeshed twin- ship based on narcissistic love rather than hatred that bound Jacob and Esau. They used their love to avoid rivalry and remained forever united.

(Piontelli, 1989, p413)

Jacob and Esau were in Chapter 25 of Genesis, when Isaac pleaded with God to have children and his wife Rebekah conceived. Rebekah questioned the lord about this as the two children fought together in the womb. Esau was the first born followed by Jacob it was believed that Jacob was born grasping at his brothers heel trying to get out first, the two of them represented power. Jacob was very intelligent and spent a lot of time struggling for power and became a leader of a tribe. Esau was seen as very impulsive and had no thought for anyone else they both moved away from each other spending all of their life fighting. There was rivalry in relation to the relationship with their parents; Esau was favoured by his father and Jacob, by his mother (Lewin, 2014.p.41). Jacob tried to use his brother's weakness asking Esau to sell his birth right. When their father was dying Jacob cheated Esau out of his father's blessing. The theme of narcissism and deceit is found throughout this whole story. Being a twin enhanced the difficulty each had in developing a mature sense of personal identity, especially as there was a paternal split in affection and this heightened the rivalry. Themes of narcissism are evident in this story as Jacob and Esau are twins, it was harder for them to develop a mature identity especially with both parents preferring one over the other. "They lived their lives as if still in utero, consumed with hostility towards each other" (Lewin, 2014.p.41). Therefore, this hated aspect of self was split off and projected into the other twin who in return was hated (Lewin, 2014.p.41).

The myth of Narcissus has been widely explored in terms of psychoanalysis and there are two versions of this myth. The first centres on the creation of a double as Narcissus sees his reflection in the water. The second that Narcissus pined for his twin sister who had died. It was claimed that Narcissus would live to an old age if he never knew himself, seeing his reflection would end his life. Narcissus was a thespian child of the river nymph Liriope. Echo loved Narcissus but he rejected her she spent the rest of her days alone repeating his last words. On one particular day Narcissus saw his reflection in the stream and fell in love with it. He could not deal with possessing yet not possessing this love and took a dagger to his breast (Graves, 1992:288). These reflections are a major part of the understanding of our internal world and are the foundations of psychoanalytic thinking. This mirroring in the water may be linked to birth and his mother. Lacan and Klein both discuss the early gaze of the infant in its' mothers eyes, with this first reflection helping to develop a sense of identity. The reflection for Narcissus, like a mirror may lead to symbiotic entrapment as this was his first

reflection of self (Lewin, 2014.p.39).The second myth believed he had a twin sister that was like him and he was in love with this twin sister. When she died he would visit the river and perhaps his reflection gave him some comfort. This love of one's image and that of a twin shows how difficult it is when a twin dies the loss of his twin-self. His reflection in the river reminded him of his twin and this loss was just too much for Narcissus (Lewin, 2014.p.40).

Twinship and Psychoanalytic Theory

Twinship refers to the development of the infant's internal world and in particular the development of the relationship between twins. Steiner (1993) discusses the fact that the breast-twin and the actual twin create permanent internal twinship. A single child creates a phantasy twin but with further development of sense of self, this disappears. Twins already have the other twin, so an intense bond develops this bond and it is much more difficult to give up, unlike the phantasy twin for the single child. The twin uses this intense bond when they are faced with situations that they may find difficult; the single child may also use the phantasy twin in the same way. Twins mutually gratify each other and use each other as a place to hide from development. Similar things can happen with single children but are less likely due to the fact that generally there is no bond established (Lewin, 2014.p.7). The phantasy twin is used to create a sense of self that is acceptable and everything else is projected on to the created twin. In relation to the "sense of self" the duration of a phantasy twin is important. Burlingham (1952) sees the internal twinning process as very powerful and is based on both the infant breast and the twin-twin relationship all begins in this internal twinship. This phantasy of having a twin for all causes us to be fascinated about actual twins even though the actual life of a twin is not so perfect. The twinship can be filled with rivalry, jealousy and aggressive feelings (Lewin, 2014.p.49).

Psychoanalysis is an area that is entrenched in a variety of perspectives, with many of these developing over time. Early psychoanalytic theory for example, was strongly oriented around the intra-psychic structure of the mind as a one-person psychology. Freud, throughout all of his writings has been pre-occupied with this idea of how we can understand our inner mental functioning (Vanheule et al., 2009; 19; 391). Sigmund Freud's early theory, in particular that of the instinctual drives, was very much one-person oriented, with the importance placed on what innately comes from an individual, separate to any external factors as influencing the

psychic state. Initially Freud thought that psychopathology was as a result of built up and repressed anxiety connected to a pleasure seeking libido, that needed to be discharged or as Balint (1956) refers to it, 'repetition...[that]...can be changed in to recollection' (p. 283) by acting out. According to Balint, Freud's work centred on 'intrapsychic observations' (Balint, 1956), however over the course of his studies, it expanded to include a two-person psychology, whereby the notion of the interpersonal became an important factor. Freud extended his belief that psychopathology was strongly connected to trauma within interpersonal relationships. In *Pleasure, Object and Libido* (1956), Balint argued that the shift to a two person psychology was identified in the sense that relations to objects were of importance in psychic development, drawing on the significance of the mother as gratifying in early development, highlighting the interpersonal as key in arrested psychic development. He placed equal importance on the pleasure-seeking tendency of the libido and the object-seeking tendency, suggesting that both factors have equal significance for psychic development.

Lacan (1961-2) in his return to Freud and his theory on identification contributed majorly to psychoanalysis; his early contributions were based on questions in relation to image, unconscious fantasy and identification. Lacan's thinking did not always come from Freud but contained ideas also from other psychoanalysts like Melanie Klein. "Identity" for Lacan can be conceptualised as how the experience of "oneself" is influenced by the interplay of forces inside the mind and the body (Vanheule et al., 2009; 19; 391). Jacques Lacan's (1936) Mirror stage was his first major contribution to Psychoanalysis and along with Melanie Klein's paranoid schizoid and depressive position, they both majorly contributed to the understanding of identity in psychoanalysis (Bailly, 2009.p.28).

Lacan explores the idea that the experience of identity is a result of the mechanism of identification and functions as an answer to the question that lies at the basis of subjectivity (Vanheule et al., 2009; 19; 391). Identity can be seen as the experience of oneself which is influenced by the interplay of forces inside and out of the body. Twins negotiate the same processes as single infants but they always have to deal with the twin. This presence of a twin can reflect and complicate common phantasies of having a twin (Lewin, 2014.p.9). This opens the question of the intense bond between twins and its effects on the identity of a twin. The author will elaborate on this further in chapter three "Identity formation in Twins".

In discussing myths and legends it is evident how much twins have awed and fascinated us down through the years and the importance of this twin relationship and its effects. The aim of the study is to go on to focus and explore what it means to be a twin from a psychoanalytic perspective. In the context of this paper, it will look firstly at “identity”, focusing on two theories from Jacques Lacan “the mirror stage” and then Melanie Klein’s “paranoid schizoid and depressive position” in an attempt to understand what it means for a single individual and how they form their identity. Outlying similarities and differences in how identity is conceptualised within these perspectives and discussing the clinical implications will then be discussed. The author will then apply these theories to twin studies, exploring the consequences and gains that can occur in relation to each child in the ‘twin ship’, focusing on how a twin forms their own identity when an (other) is always present. The study will also discuss psychoanalysis and how intervening in a twin system can affect the other twin. Through the authors work with children and some observations of identical and non-identical twins, a question of identity has arisen. In this thesis, the author hopes to contribute to the understanding of twins and complications that may occur with twins who present to analysis.

Before moving on, it is important to outline the definition of “twins” and “identity” and explore the fascination and mythology that is related to twins. A twin is one of two children born at the same time they are offspring’s that are produced by the same pregnancy. Dizygotic twins, are referred to as fraternal twins, they are the result of two different eggs undergoing fertilization by two different sperms. Monozygotic twins are often referred to as identical twins, and occur as the result of one egg splitting and forming separate zygotes, identical twins have almost exactly the same DNA.(Berger,2008p.69,70). Identity on the other hand is a definition of one’s self as a unique individual, in terms of roles, attitudes, beliefs and aspirations (Berger, 2008p. 415).The sameness of a person or thing at all times or in all circumstances; the condition or fact that a person or things itself and not something else; the condition or fact of remaining the same person throughout the various phase of existence; continuity of the personality.

Chapter Two

Identity Formation: Jacques Lacan and Melanie Klein

Jacques Lacan's Formation of Identity, "The mirror stage" (1936)

Lacan's (1961-1962) Seminar on Identification shows that identity can be explained in terms of an entity that is equal to itself. He observes a point in development that one can begin to experience one as oneself. Lacan indicates that this experience of identity is a result of the mechanisms of identification and this functions to ask the question of 'who am I?'

One of Lacan key developments was that of the human psyche as a whole entity comprising inseparable conscious and unconscious elements; in Lacanian terms this was 'the birth of the subject'. His first original contribution to psychoanalysis concerned 'the mirror stage' (Bailly, 2009. p.28). In this, Lacan provides an understanding of mirroring and the infant's recognition in the mirror; this mirror stage for the infant is in the imaginary. The mirror stage is the first time the infant begins to understand and represent itself; it thinks of itself as "I" in relationship with an image in the mirror. There is great fascination from the infant at the sight of its' own image in the mirror and they are excited by the correspondent movements in the mirror. From birth until around 18 months, the infant's perception of its' own body within its' environment is absent and fragmented; this lack of sensory and motor coordination add to the libidinal drives causing helplessness and malaise (Lacan 1977.p2). The mirror for Lacan is understood as an identification that takes place when the infant sees the image. This is an intellectual act by the child that involves translation of the image into an idea of "self" (Lacan, 1977.p2). The child identifies itself in the mirror but it also identifies with something that's separate. It is this separate other that the child first identifies and experiences itself. This act of identity is emotional and intellectual but furthermore, it is the separation of the subject from itself into an object. The foundation of human identity is an act of narcissism, the place of this in the creation of the subject and identity is the seeing of oneself as an image and the love of the image that is oneself" (Lacan 1977, p.2). Pines (1984) places emphasis on

the mirror and how it is conveying identity. He emphasises that a mother's response to a child's behaviour reinforces certain behaviour and promotes identity (Pines, 1984, p.32)

This visual gestalt that the infant sees as oneself, this mirror reflection of the body is not to be confused with the "self" or subject. For Lacan, he calls it the Ego and emphasises its' structure as identity for all identifications (Lacan 1977, .p.3). The ego comes into being as a reaction to this state in which the infant finds itself (Lacan, 2004. pp75, 162). After the baby identifies itself as the ideal" I" the growth of the ego comes with the process of language acquisition. The infant sees the object in the mirror which it identifies as itself and hears the mother name it. They have already heard their name but this now fixes the name to the image in the mirror and they can begin to realise that is "me". The child then attributes some characteristics and traits to this 'me' in the mirror. Through this identification with the image in the mirror the infant speaks in an objective case "me" and then a subjective case "I" as this language develops it attaches to the object self and then becomes the Ego. In the mirror stage the infant is supported by the mother and is encouraged to solve the situation. The mother usually says look that's you in the mirror, the child then becomes overwhelmed with recognising that it is them that the image represents, then they turn back and look at their mother; this is the point when the mother confirms their discovery (Lacan, 1977p.6). The child identifies with an image outside himself, be it an actual mirror image or simply the image of another child. If I identify with an image outside myself, I can do things I could not do before. Lacan calls the register in which this identification takes place 'the imaginary' emphasising the importance of the visual field and specular relation which underlines the child's captivation in the image. Lacan shows how this alienation in the image corresponds with the ego. The ego is constituted by an alienating identification based on an initial lack of completeness in the body and nervous system (Fonagy et al, 2009 p.1-21). However this finding of "the self" turns to "loss of self" once the child begins to realise the image is outside of themselves (Pines, 1984.p33).

The infant experiences another mirror and this is the mother's gaze; it comes before the mirror stage for Lacan the importance of the mirror goes beyond the gaze of the mother. The child's identity is first formed in this gaze from the mother; the child sees himself in the mothers face. This alter-ego seen by the child in the mothers face builds the foundations for the child response to the mirror later on. This narcissistic move leads to the development of identity; if the gaze fails, the identity of the child will be affected. A failure within the mirror

stage can have major effects on the child this can happen even when mum is present but normally the gaze would be filled with love giving the child a positive reflection of itself. It is this consistent gaze of love that develops a child's identity. A mother who may be selfish or suffer from mental health issues can cause a distortion within the mirror and this in return produces a narcissistic weakness in which identity is developed. A child who sees no alter-ego of themselves, remain fragmented for too long, causing major effects (Burgoyne, 1997p.28-29).

Lacan stresses that images are very important to human development. The infant has a lack of sensory and motor skills which results in a fragmented experience of the body. Lacan see that the ego then comes as a reaction to this fragmented state of the body. The significance of reflections, mirroring, doubles and the gaze are part of our understanding of our internal world and have come incorporated psychoanalytic thinking and identification (Lewin, 2014 p36).

Jacques Lacan (1938) Family Complexes

Lacan's (1938) Family Complexes discusses the complex of intrusion (jealously archetype of all social sentiments) within the family. This intrusion represents the experience of the primitive subject (Lacan, 1938. p.45). This complex is the experience in which the child experiences when they see another subject in which they have to share a relationship within the home. This is when the child realises that they have other siblings. "This jealousy at its most fundamental does not represent biological rivalry but rather a mental identification" (Lacan, 1938.p.33). The child through identification is committed to jealousy and the child either goes back to the maternal object and refuses the real, destroying the other or they are lead to another object and they accept it (Lacan, 1938.p.33). In this complex, Lacan also refers to the "mirror identification the brother or sister who resembles the subject is initially cathected as a mirror reflection identificatory object that is both unifying and alienating, the sibling is experienced as an intruder" (Lacan, 1938.p.45). The infant is full of primitive aggressive impulses which can be lined to the death instinct. Lacan gives an example of this when St Augustine describes infantile jealousy where the child goes pale at the sight of his brother at the breast. The jealousy is a mental identification within the child directed at their siblings. Both Freud and Augustine were deeply concerned about religion, love and sexuality they were very different but also shared certain thought. Freud never really discussed sibling

rivalry in his work and this could have been due to the death of Freud's younger brother. Jones (1953) discusses how Freud recalls his sibling jealousy of his brother Julius who died at 8 months. At this time Freud was doing analysis on himself Jones received this letter in which he had sent to Fleiss. In this letter to Fleiss on the 3rd of October (1897) Freud admits to this jealousy and how he felt dethroned from his place in his mother love.

Klein (1955) highlights the importance of sibling rivalry and jealousy in the early stages of the Oedipus complex. The child has the fantasy that the bad penis has created bad babies inside of the mother body; this is the penis from which the child's own sadism has been projected. These brothers and sisters may be real or fantasised by the child (Klein, 1955.p.158). For Klein (1937), love guilt and reparation difficulties in family relationships depend upon the circumstances and psychological factors and the development of love between parents. It can happen that a child may not be what one of the parents wanted them to be, a parent may wish they were like another brother or sister. Another difficulty may arise if parents are too over ambitious (Klein, 1937.p.321). According to Klein (1915) there can be sadistic desires which are directed against the new born child and there can be feelings of hate and jealousy that can cause guilt. Klein also focuses on the positive effects of a sibling and how brothers and sisters can help the child move away from parents and develop better relationships with their siblings. Furthermore, Frances Tustin (1972) explores sibling rivalry in relation to autistic children; her study is called "the nest of babies". Children with autism have two main stages; they either have no sense of an internal psychic life with needs to be revived by the analyst or they become aware of their own mind and that it's different to everyone else's. When they become aware of their own mind is where Tustin believes rivalry begins; this is what she called "the nest of babies" (Tustin, 1972, p.177-8). This awareness of otherness and their own mind gives rise to the rivalry this happens long before the early stage of the oedipal complex and construction of sexual identity (Tustin, 1972.p.178).

Rosner (1985) discusses the implications of sibling rivalries having consequences on a baby triggering intense instinctual and libidinal strivings. For a baby the taunting, preferences by other siblings can cause guilt, jealousy and long term effects on the ego development and formation of object relations. Alessandra Piontelli (2002)² discusses the fact that twins born

² Piontelli, A. (2002) twins: from foetus to child. London and New York: Routledge.

into families with older siblings all siblings are disrupted by their arrival. However the younger siblings of twins seem to suffer even more. The competitiveness and fear of strivings can also have effect on the ego formation. Freud also refers to siblings and sibling rivalry in his writings (1900), (1909), (1912-13), (1917), (1918), (1920) (1927), having the view that an older sibling may feel put to the side and they act out when they meet the new baby. After his discovery of the oedipal complex, he gives less of his time to sibling rivalry in terms of the child (Mitchell, 2000). Freud (1900) was aware of dreams that involved death wishes towards parents and siblings reflecting aggression. Freud in his earlier papers gives positive and negative meaning to siblings and their rivalry usually is the older child that feels set aside when the baby is born. Freud's (1909) case history, phobia of a five year old boy, shows the implications of a sibling on little Hans and the implications on his psychosexual development after the birth of his sister Hannah. During the Oedipus complex the birth of a sibling reminds the child of an infidelity of the parent, the child's love object.

Melanie Klein formation of Identity "Depressive position & Paranoid-schizoid"

Melanie Klein (1946) was a German psychoanalyst who favoured an interpretation of the individual's psychological development based on the influence of early mother-infant interaction. She initiated what is known as the school of object-relations theory that stemmed from her experiences of daughtering and mothering based on her close observational work with infants and their mothers, as well as with neurotic children during play therapy. Scharff (1996) suggests that Klein's thinking strongly emphasised the belief that 'the individual's need to relate to others' results in the subsequent establishment of an internal, emotional world and way of experiencing oneself. As a result of intense observational work and descriptions of child development, Klein favoured a view to understand experience 'from inside the child's mind' (Scharff, 1996).

Her theory developed four main concepts relevant to her work; splitting, projection, introjection and projective identification, which she discussed in her papers *On Observing the Behaviour of Young Infants* (1952); *Notes On Some Schizoid Mechanisms* (1946) and *Some Theoretical Conclusions Regarding the Emotional life of the Infant* (1952). These concepts are relevant for a grasp of the core of object-relations theory. Klein's view asserted that the most vital feature of an infant's emotional development is that which unfolds in

relation to the 'first object, the mother and towards food', suggesting that these are interconnected from the beginning of life. Nancy Chodorow (1999) describes this as an interpersonal relationship, where the 'mother's experience of her child' lays the foundation for the way in which the child experiences the mother, as well as itself. The establishment of who 'I am' is reliant on this period (Chodorow, 1999).

The infant's psychic structure consists of unconscious, divided experiences of self-relation with an inner object world, which was made up of elements of its' mother. In notes on 'Some Schizoid Mechanisms' (1946), Klein outlines that object relations exist from the beginning of life and dominates the first phase of mental life and is characterised by the relation to part objects where there is a splitting of the ego and in the object causing paranoid anxiety. The depressive position occurs when the infant recognises the mother as a whole object; this is a constellation of the object relations that have occurred due to the infant's attack of the ambivalent loved mother and choosing her as an external and internal object. In Klein's (1940) paper on mourning and its' relation to manic depressive states, she describes the depressive position "as a process of early reality testing and argues that this is a prototypical form of what will later become the process of mourning (Klein, 1940.p344). This then suggests that the infant attempts to relieve anxiety by trying to 'satisfy both external and internalised objects' (p. 153). For Klein "mental life was seen as emerging gradually out of primordial chaos in which life enhancing and destructive tendencies initially mingle and form a paranoid schizoid position" (Klein,1946.p.146). Fragmented phantasies are dealt with by the infant through the splitting of a 'good (gratifying) and 'bad' (frustrating) breast' (p. 293) during the 'paranoid schizoid' position, where the infant's perception transforms the mother into two separate people. Problems arise if these two 'mothers' merge. These ideas are best illustrated in Segal's (2004) example of the 'good' and 'bad' nipple: the infants 'fantasy of a nipple that is loving, feeding, creative and good' relates to an infant's perception when it feels comfortable and peaceful, whereby phantasies of a 'biting, hurtful, and terrifying' nipple relate to the infant's perception when stressed. (p. 33) the emotions of love and hate, that Klein believed are conflicts which are present from birth, become severed during splitting, with love directed at 'the good' mother and hate at the 'bad mother'.

This example relates to Klein's (1952) notion of the 'persecutory anxiety' discussed in 'On Observing the Behaviour of Young Infants' (1952), where terror is evoked and experienced by the infant as the earliest frightening 'unconscious phantasies of annihilation in which life

is under threat' (Segal, 2004,p.29) in situations where it has to adapt to new conditions (Klein, 1952). The mother's care is essential during these moments to relieve this anxiety, particularly in the gratification gained from receiving food from the mother's breast. '...the mother's patient and understanding handling from the earliest days onwards is the greatest moment.' (Klein, 1952, p. 242) .She argued that pleasure associated with 'good' experiences of suckling - where no difficulties in feeding exist - and of the mother-object laid the foundations for 'future...emotional development as a whole' (p. 240). Negative experiences that result in a refusal of food is an indicator of 'severe disturbance', highlighting that there was a deficiency in developing object relations where the persecutory anxiety and destructive impulses dominate.

Despite separating itself from Freud's framework, Klein's object-relations perspective is intrinsically linked to aspects of her thought, particularly her ideas regarding the introjection of objects and the drive theory. She outlines that in situations when the infant is gratified, introjection of the good breast can occur. Failure of this can result in the pathological development. In 'Some Theoretical Conclusions Regarding the Emotional life of the Infant' (1952), Klein discusses the infant's developing ego as connected to the two opposing instincts of life and death. She thought that 'oral-libidinal or oral-destructive' impulses influence the earliest relation with the first object, and are directed at the mother's breast. In periods 'free from hunger and tension', there is a balance between these drives. However, if equilibrium is disturbed, such as when the 'bad breast' frustrates, aggressive impulses will dominate. The infant relieves anxiety through the mother by directing its aggression at her in the form of a phantasied 'oral sadistic' attack of 'devouring and scooping out the mother's body.' (p. 206) This idea links to her conceptualisation of 'unconscious phantasy', which she described as the 'unconscious embodiment of drives', the primitive elements of the psyche that unconsciously determine everything that occurs at conscious and rational levels. Since the infant's experience of itself is based on the gesture of the mother, the negative hated mother is also a hated 'self'. Klein argued that there is a desire to 'fill her body with [...] the bad parts of the self which are split off and projected into her'. (p. 206)

In Melanie Klein's 'Love, guilt and reparation and other works' (1921-1945), Klein views that the phantasies of the breast and of the paternal couple are innate and are central to the development of each individual. The outcome of the depressive position depends on working through of preceding phase. For Klein (1935) the depressive position is a central role in the

child's early development. For with the introjection of the object as a whole the infant's object-relation alters fundamentally. The love and hated aspects of the complete objects gives rise to feelings of mourning and guilt which imply vital advances in the infant's emotional and intellectual life. The paranoid-schizoid position is linked with the death instinct and was a stage on position for the child from which these residues can remain and surface later in life. Joan Riviera (2002) saw the importance of these early paranoid-schizoid anxieties and mechanisms in this early depressive process in infancy (Riviere, 2002.p.292).

Melanie Klein (1946) viewed that object relations are there from the very beginning of life; this relationship is between whole and part objects. When a child is born they cannot percept images of their mother, but they can feel the breast smelling and tasting the milk which is part objects. For any child, objects are always involved; there is no mental process or anxiety provoking situation or urge that doesn't involve them. "Object relations are at the centre of emotional life" (Klein, 1952). This first object for the infant is the mothers' breast; it is part-object and is experienced within Phantasy as whole or as Klein calls it 'total situation' (Klein,1946. p147). For the infant it then becomes split into good gratifying and bad frustrating breast, this splitting then causes love and hate. The infant feels satisfied at the breast but when the breast is gone they can feel frustrated, this frustration is what creates the phantasy of bad breast, as the child projects something bad that they feel inside on to the breast. The breast then becomes persecutory as the infant feels that the breast may attack them. "This persecutory object has had violent, hostility and hatred projected into it this hatred dominates this stage which Klein called the paranoid-schizoid position" (Klein, 1937). The outcome of the depressive position depends on working through of preceding phase. For Klein (1935) the depressive position is central in the child's early development; the introjection of the object as a whole the infant's object-relation change fundamentally. The love and hated part of the complete objects reinforces feelings of mourning and guilt which are extremely important in the infant's emotional and intellectual life. The paranoid-schizoid position is linked with the death instinct and was a stage on position for the child these residues can remain and surface later in life" (Klein, 1935).

Klein (1946) developed the idea of projective identification when describing the paranoid-schizoid position in relation to thinking and feeling that she thought was a part of early infancy but which she also thought might continue into childhood and adulthood. The paranoid-schizoid position good and bad experiences and are kept apart as much as possible,

the good being idealized and the bad demonised. In phantasy, good and bad feelings are projected into external objects so that they too are spit. An internal object happens due to identification with the external object but it is not simple. The self and object are split during identification into good and bad parts the good parts of object and elf are then combined and experienced as part of self. Bad parts of self and object are combined but are also projected. What in fact is identified in the paranoid-schizoid position is a defence against anxieties that have arisen from the unbearable sense of self. "Identification defends one against an unbearable sense of who one isn't, by attributing indispensable aspects of an object to oneself" (Caper, 2007.p.96).

From the beginning the destructive impulse is turned against the object and is first expressed in phantasies on the mother's breast and soon develops towards the mother's body by sadistic means. The fears then arising from the infant in relation to robbing the mother's body of its good parts this for the infant is a typical defence of early ego. Klein believed this to be weak just like the mechanisms of splitting the object, impulses, idealization, denial of inner/ outer reality and emotions of the infant. If persecutory fears from the mother's breast are very strong and the infant cannot work through this paranoid-schizoid position, the working through of the depressive position is in turn prevented. This failure may cause a regressive reinforcing of persecutory fears and in turn strengthen the fixation points for severe psychoses in the child. This may also cause serious difficulties arising during the period of the depressive position and may cause manic-depressive disorders later in life. The less severe disturbances of development may also strongly influence the choice of neurosis. The relation to the first object implies its introjection and projection and from the beginning object-relations become moulded by an interaction between introjection and projection and between internal and external objects and situations the infant faces. These then build the ego and superego and prepare for the onset of Oedipus complex in the second half of the 1st year.

The outcome of the depressive position depends on working through of preceding phase. For Klein (1935) the depressive position is central in the child's early development the introjection of the object as a whole the infant's object –relation change fundamentally. The love and hated part of the complete objects reinforces feelings of mourning and guilt which are extremely important in the infant's emotional and intellectual life." The paranoid-schizoid position is linked with the death instinct and was a stage on position for the child these residues can remain and surface later in life" (Klein, 1935). Klein moved away from trying to

overcome the depressive position and spoke of penetrating and attaining it (Meltzer, 2008p.154).

This theoretical framework strongly influenced many contemporary authors that preceded Klein in theorising an understanding of the emotional ambivalence connected to the development of one's identity. In discussing Jacques Lacan's "Mirror Stage" and Melanie Klein's "depressive position" and "schizoid mechanisms", the importance of a child's development is highlighted. There are many factors that contribute to the child's sense of self and there development of identity. This will be further explored in chapter 3 where the author will apply these theories of identity to the question of "what does it mean to be a twin?", focusing on the challenges, complications and secondary gain.

Chapter Three

Identity formation “Twins”

Melanie Klein

In Melanie Klein's *Love, guilt and reparation* and other works (1921-1945) Klein views that the phantasies of the breast and of the paternal couple are innate and is central to the development of each individual. She also views that the phantasies of the breast and of the paternal couple are innate and are central to the development of each individual. Vivienne Lewin (2014) questions where siblings or twins fit in. This twin relationship is fundamentally linked with the infant's earliest experiences with both mother and twin; this also includes the prenatal period. They are faced with a very difficult task in differentiating itself from its twin, the same way as it does an infant from its mother's breast. This may cause difficulties in establishing a good symbiotic tie with the maternal object when the other twin is always there. The early relationship with the mother is very much connected with the twinning process of twins, unlike a single infant, being a twin with the breast affects the development of the sense of self "identity" for the twins. They find it harder to differentiate itself from its twin just like a single infant from its mother's breast.

Twins need to negotiate the same emotional development as single children but they also have to deal with the fact of being a twin. The presence of a twin complicates and reflects common development phantasies of having a twin. The longing for a twin is related to the experience in relation to its mother. Klein (1963) suggests that this internal loneliness is due to wanting a perfect internal state and a phantasy twin provides the illusion of perfect state. For Klein the ego exists and operates from birth and would be dominated by splitting mechanisms. The good and bad is split and projected into an object creating the phantasy of a split mother- good and bad. The urge to integrate and split is achieved by the introjection of the good breast based on experience of mother. For a twin they have to develop a relationship with their mother with another baby always present (Lewin, 2014,p.9). Klein believes that the child relates to the other twin and mother as primary objects especially when mother is not there. The sense of loneliness in each twin can be made better by the presence of the other twin. The phantasy twin created to stop the loneliness is embodied in the other twin. The twins use each other to mourn the loss of their mother and fill the gap. This may cause a

problem in relation to the twins separating due to this primary bonding especially because there is not a gap or separateness between them. The early relationship with the mother is very much connected with the twinning process of twins, unlike a single infant being a twin with the breast affects the development of the sense of self “identity” for the twins. They find it harder to differentiate itself from its twin just like a single infant from its mother’s breast (Klein, 1963:312). Leonard (1961) explores the idea that having a twin constantly present during infancy will affect the object relationship with the mother; this may cause difficulties in language and stop other object relations (Leonard, 1961, p.307). Many twins show slightly delayed development in language acquisition; this can be due to less verbal communication with adults in twins who have to share their mother. For each twin there is less language directed towards them individually and more as a unit. This close twinship that the infants have means sometimes they don’t need words, other times twins develop their own unique language (Leonard, 1961, p.308). If the twin bond is always strong, it can get in the way of the relationship with the mother. The twin’s relationship is linked to these early experiences with both the mother and twin, when the mother spends time with one twin then she is less available for the other. This then excludes one of the twins, including the father can also complicate things further as this creates six pairs and four triads. Twins use each other as transitional objects, instead of breaking away from the dual relationship between mother and baby they create another between themselves(Lewin,2014,p.4-5).

Jacques Lacan

In relation to Lacan’s (1936) Mirror Stage, he highlights the importance of both the gaze and mirror stage for the formation of identity and an understanding of the internal world. Burlingham (1952) was the first to note that dizygotic twins identify their mirror images before monozygotic ones³. Alessandra Piontelli (1992) discusses how much more baffling and complex life is for identical twins. Her study from one year onwards focused on the reactions of twins in front of the mirror. Identical twins took a lot longer to recognise the image as their own face with some not reaching this point till the age of three or four. For identical twins they recognised their co-twin while looking in the mirror after feeling and touching the face in the mirror they looked around for their twin. They were always very concerned until they found their twin but this did not happen for non- identical twins. Non identical twins initially saw the image in the mirror as another child but by the age of two

³ Zazzo French psychologist was the first to study reactions of twins in the mirror.

they had recognised it was them. For identical twins until they recognised what they were looking at was indeed their own face, they did not know that they had such similar appearance of their twin. Many were quite confused and asked ‘but who am I’ and doubts about their identities emerge. One child asked ‘but why two? Is she me or am I her?’ Awareness of their own image in the mirror also brought dawning awareness that they were identical twins. When twins became older, the non-identical twins were not treated as twins by peers and were not singled out due to their appearance and as they moved into the wider community, were no longer regarded socially as twins. For identical twins, the link to each other was further reinforced as they moved out of the home. Peers looked at them as single entities even when placed in separate groups. Children are great at noticing anything that is not the norm like identical twin causing them to be isolated because they are different. Parents of identical twins said that their twin children were very confused and somewhat babbled long after this discovery (Piontelli, 1992.p9.). This highlights the question of who is that other in the mirror for the twin? Are they seeing a fragmented image of their other twin as it takes them longer to recognise the mirror image as their own, unlike single children or non-identical twins? Lacan’s (1936) ‘Mirror Stage’ is the first time the infant begins to understand and represent itself when it thinks of itself as an “I” in relationship with an image in the mirror; but what happens if they don’t recognise this till three or later four years of age? Does this affect their sense of self as they identify with each other? This delayed identification in the mirror in turn, has interfered with the twin’s ability to establish their own separate identity. Leonard (1961) discusses the ideas that twins whom have a sense of oneness do not see themselves as separated to their twin. This leaves them with the confrontation with the image in the mirror, this identification with their twin. This identification can continue through life and cause confusion in terms of identity and burling of their self-image (Leonard, 1961.p.307).

Sibling rivalry and jealousy is evident especially in a family where there is twins and other sibling. Burlingham (1952) claims this to be an area that is largely neglected, this relationship between siblings. There is always a lot of attention given when twins are born into a family, this in return can make other siblings jealous. Furthermore, there exists a twinship in which the twins have excluded their siblings; this leaves the single sibling wanting another or wanting to be a part of this relationship. However, twins also feel rivalry and jealousy in

relation to their singleton siblings due to the fact they are individual, different and have been able to develop their own identity (Lewin, 2014.p.199).

Dorothy Burlingham

Dorothy Burlingham (1945) was a psychoanalyst and long term partner of Anna Freud who suggested that being a twin is the “closet tie between two individuals” (2013). Her studies lead to the understanding that twins enjoyed or suffered through an intimacy in their co-development, dependencies and emotional rapport. Mothers were seen not to be able to connect to their twins until they get to know them apart from each other. This is regarded by Burlingham as a defence by the child from anxieties that have arisen from the oedipal situation, or against the loss of an love object due to a younger sibling (Lewin, 2014.p.24).The creation of the phantasy twin Burlingham discusses the widespread fascination with twins and suggests it stems from a fantasy that people develop when they're young, learning to cope with their separateness from their parents. In (1945) the fantasy twin, Burlingham wrote the relationship between the twins is imagined as an untroubled and unchanging one, but in reality the twin struggles with their partners and often hates being pigeonholed. As well as a need for independence she also saw the need for coexisted with fear of separation. This tension between conflicting feelings surface at different stages of early life. At first each twin expressed a wish for self-gratification for the mother's attention. In the case of the twins this wish for gratification came at the expense of the other twin as they had to compete with each other for maternal affection. This wish then transformed into a desire to share; by the age of two, the twins felt it was important to have the same things at the same time yet this desire did not erase the earlier competitiveness the struggle remained now on having equal amounts. They would put aside their rivalry to defend their twin. However, Burlingham saw that it is very important for the twins to carve out some sense of individual identity. They seemed to seek approval from each other where a single child would seek approval from a parent. These studies however only looked at early years before they started school (Burlingham, 1945:205-210).

Dorothy Burlingham (1945) also looked at “the fantasy of having a twin” Many single children create a phantasy of an imaginary twin, but this tends to fade with the infants own individual development. Wanting a twin or longing for one comes from the infants earliest experiences with their mother, due to some inconsistent and unsatisfied longing for can lead to a sense of internal loneliness. In the latency period for the child they use the other twin for love and attention protecting themselves from this loneliness (Lewin, 2014.p.24). Klein (1963) believes that this loneliness is the ‘yearning for an unattainable perfect internal state” a phantasy twin provides the illusion of attaining this perfect state. Twins relate not only to their mother but to each other as primary objects, especially when the mother is not there. This loneliness experienced and the phantasy twin created becomes embodied in the other twin. Therefore, instead of mourning the loss of the mother the gap is filled by the other twin. The major difficulty for the twins would be separating as they have always lacked separateness between them. In Burlingham’s (1952) paper twins: ‘the study of identical twins’ she discussed the early stages of infancy and how important it is for a mother to talk to each twin individual as she would with a single child. Mothers do this at the beginning but as the infants get older the mother starts to enjoy their unity affecting their relationship. Twins have more emotional ties than a single child. Twins have their twinship the relationship with their mother and later their father. For twins these relationships influence and sometimes act against each other. However, both twins have the task of working through the depressive position and schizoid- mechanism with the mother with the other twin present but they also have to deal with this good and bad love and hate with their twin. For each twin they find it difficult being alone with mother or being alone with their twin (Lewin, 2014.p.50). Leonard (1961) also explores this idea that libinal ties are established very early for twins and this causes conflicts that the twins need to work through in relation to the relationship with the mother she also sees the level of identification between twins higher than with parents or siblings (Leonard, 1961:307). Burlingham (1946) discovered that some mothers find it hard to identify with their twins and can be jealous of the attention that comes with having twins. They try to treat the twins as equal to stop rivalry but this in return stops individual treatment but some mothers want to treat them as a whole. Burlingham notes that some twin don’t go on to develop different personalities this could be due to the mother attitude towards the twins or the relationship the twins have (Lewin, 2014.p.66).The phantasy of a twin may cause an onlooker this fascination with the twins may cause them to feel special better than others causing a narcissistic twin relationship and a sense of identity that is limited in the twinship.

Clinical observation Hampstead Nursery's (1931-1948)

Anna Freud & Dorothy Burlingham

Burlingham (1963) observes the development of two twins Bill and Bert in one of her studies. It was observed that they showed similar movements copying each other and she believes this may have been linked to identity. They both had not developed normal contact with each other or themselves and this was down to their intense twinship where their relationship had not developed further; this in return affected their relationship with others. Burlingham observed that earlier in development the formation of the superego was destroyed by the twin's involvement in each other and not an external object. Bill was observed as being the dominant twin and this dominance made it very difficult for Bert's ego development to happen normally. They spent four months with their mother who found them very difficult to care for, so they went to the nursery and their mother went back to work⁴. They were identical and almost everyone found it very difficult to tell them apart often when separated they would often mistake their image in the mirror as their twin. They were the mirror image of each other and this caused a lot of rivalry between them throughout their life. This was very evident in therapy when they were trying to separate themselves (Burlingham, 1963.p.390). While in therapy, both twins felt that the other might murder them as they assumed they had identical thoughts. Bill, the second born felt he was losing his identity and had lost his birth right to Bert. For both twins they were the mirror image of each other their own mother had difficulty telling them apart and their attachment with her was very weak. This relationship with the mother is very important in relation to identity; this twinship also made it very difficult for them to find their own identity. Both boys found it difficult to recognise their mirror image showing that "living in the presence of the twin was for them synonymous with living in the presence of their own reflection" (Burlingham, 1936.p.403).

Alessandra Piontelli

Alessandra Piontelli (1989) describes observations made using ultra-sound on two pairs of fraternal twins in utero and has shown how certain temperamental characteristics are continuous pre- and post-natally. She comments that the 'psychological birth' of an infant appears to be a highly individual matter some children show evidence of psychological

⁴ The twins were born out of an affair and their mother later went on to marry and have another child, they spent all their childhood in and out of institutions

awareness long before birth. These observations were of several pregnancies followed in pre-natal stages at monthly meetings and then weekly after birth for one year. Piontelli questions what happens when two foetus are contained within the womb at the same time. Will the twins develop a relationship and will they have a preconscious psychological birth (Piontelli, 1989.p.416). In all twin pregnancies it is observed that one twin is favoured and they grow at the expense of the other twin; in some extreme cases it causes the death of the other twin.

From the very beginning, twins have different experiences that have a major bearing on their future mental and development. While in the womb some twins acted like born brothers; they had their temperaments, expressions and preferred positions. In some cases, the other twin withdrew and turned away and others did not react at all. The twins interacted both gently and violently stroking each other's faces and kicking as if they were fighting (Piontelli, 1989.p.417). Each couple of twins that were observed had they own way of interacting and this continued through pregnancy and was noted in post-natal life. Piontelli observed a set of twins who were later called Mark and Celia; Celia was much smaller but was very active and quite lively and her parents remarked that they hoped she would calm down before birth. Mark was observed in the womb to be restless and was always searching for some peace; he often used the placenta as a pillow. Any stimulates seemed to disturb Mark. However when Celia continued to kick him he would turn away from her and in some occasions he would kick her back. It seemed as though Celia was always trying to make contact but Mark always withdrew (Piontelli, 1989. p.419). At 38 weeks, Celia stopped growing and the pregnancy was induced. Mark was born first very quiet where Celia was a nervy type. After birth, Celia began to reach out trying to touch Mark but he still turned away. It was only around three months old that Mark began to open his eyes more and interact with his environment but he could not stand strong emotions, laughing or getting too excited would cause him to vomit (Piontelli, 1989.p.420). By a year old, Celia was moving around the house exploring everything where Mark enjoyed staying on his mother's knee gripping on to the same toys in each observation. Furthermore, Piontelli's (1989) twin observations from foetus to child shows that single foetus individuality is present from the early stages and for twins too that are sharing a womb. It does not seem to affect the temperament of the twins but does have some affect in terms of pre-natal experiences. One thing that was very clear within these observations is that relating is established very early on within each twin the case study. Although the case of Mark and Celia showed this relation in a non-relating way, as Mark turned away from his sister (Piontelli, 1989.p.425).

Piontelli (2002) later observed that when one twin was feeding the mother would engage with the other. Mother would give attention to each twin but in short spurts; she also observed that unconsciously the mother give more attention to one twin. This can be due to a weaker baby or one that is a lot more active. Each twin is very aware of age- related attention and can become very jealous of the attention in which they receive from their mother. There seems to be higher levels of jealousy in children who are the same age. However between the ages of 12-15 months Piontelli observed that twins became pre-occupied with each other and would cry when separated but did not get upset when their mother left the room as long as they were together.

Sigmund Freud

Sigmund Freud's psychosexual stages of development is discussed in his "three essays on the theory of sexuality" (1901-1905) where a child's sense of identity is thought to be developed through the infant's relationship primarily with its mother and later, its father. Therefore, for twins this internal structure would be more complicated. The presence of the other twin leads to a situation in which mother and twins create a triad prior to the (Freud's) oedipal triad. For twins there would be three pair relationships mother- twin 1, mother-twin 2, and twin 1-twin 2. The initial development process for twin 1 would be shaped by the relationship with mother and by the relationship of twin 2. For twin 2 could theoretically be on a continuum between sibling rivalry and merging, and would include twin 1's perception of the twin 2-mother relationship. Through this complex structure each twin will develop a sense of identity. In (1900) Freud acknowledges the importance of siblings and their effects on each other.

Freud's 'psychosexual stages of development' state that a child is observably sexual until the age of four where they reach the stage of latency where sexual instincts and sexual energy have been redirected away from their true sexual aims on to new ones; this phase is called sublimation and this new aim still satisfies sexual urges and plays a major role in the development of the infant and is placed at the start of sexual latency of the child's childhood (Freud, 1900). Freud looks at the child's pregenital stages before the component instincts unite; the first stage is oral where the sexual aim is an incorporation of the object and is part of the child's identification. The second stage is the sadistic anal stage it is the opposition between two currents active and passive and they run all the way through sexual life. The final stage is the phallic stage of Freud's psychosexual development where the child finds

pleasure within the genitals and little boys have feelings for their mothers but due to the Oedipus complex they fear that their fathers will castrate them if they knew their sexual feelings for their mother (Freud, 1900). It was with this discovery of the oedipal events in analysis of neuroses, that Freud uncovered this complex and defines the psychic relationships within the family. There may be some differences in the development of sexuality of individual opposite-sex twins, based on primitive and later identifications with the other twin and with parents in the oedipal configuration (Lewin, 2014). The ego is first a bodily ego and is derived from the bodily sensations of an infant this would cause major implications for conjoined twins. Therefore, the twins whom are superficially attached may find it very confusing in defining their own bodily image. This would have profound effects on the sense of self as this is established through the infant's experience of their own body (Freud, 1923p.26).

Wilfred Bion

For Bion (1967) 'the imaginary twin in a containing presence' whereby the mother is felt by the infant to be part of itself, in her absence, it is as if that part of the self has been lost. In this state of mind the infant loses its sense of being at one with itself; in fact, of being whole. In reference to Bion's work Klein (1963) suggests "that the twin figure represents those understood and splits off parts of the self, which the individual is longing to regain, in hope of achieving wholeness and complete understanding" (Klein, 1963.p.302). The imaginary twin then represents an idealised internal relationship for the infant. As the infant moves towards the depressive position it is negotiated, and then the idealisation of the imaginary twin fades and disappears. Bion describes the process where the projections of the infant are transformed by a containing mother into thoughts that form a narrative so that it can be understood. Where the developing infant has experienced a very good containing environment, the helpful introjected object enables the infant to move from the paranoid-schizoid position towards the depressive position, and towards the greater abilities within the family. The infant's experience of the absence of the object enables the construction of the first thought (Bion, 1962). The creation of the phantasy twin is a narcissistic affair based on the processes of splitting and projective identification operating between parts of the self and external object. Bion (1967) suggests that the breast is the infant's first imaginary twin created. The phantasied twin, a double, an alter ego has several functions. This may be used

for gratifying unfulfilled wishes or defence against unwanted aspects of self (Bion, 1967.p.19).

Death of a twin

The death of a twin has major effects on both the parents and the other twin regardless of their relationship or age. The death of a twin does not free a twin from this twinship but adds more difficulties for them. The twin that has died may carry important projections that are linked to life, death and survival and these would be played out in the phantasies of the surviving twin. These phantasies are controlled by the twin and then tested in relation to external reality. Piontelli (1989) in her foetus observations discovers that infants that have been together interact very early on within the pregnancy and this pattern of relating carried after birth. Therefore if a twin died early on there will be some implications for the other twin as they had already been relating within the womb. The twin will experience the absence and separation as well as the grieving parents. Personality development can be affected due to the guilt and the confusion of identity with the dead twin (Lewin, 2014.p.200). Surviving twins may be referred to as the twin or may find it very difficult when they are regarded as a single person. Lewin (2014) discusses the idea of a phantasy twin that has been created when a twin has died from her own work with surviving twins in analysis. The twin eliminated the pain of the loss of their twin by creating an analytic twinship. The patient lived out the life and death relationship with the transference twin, Lewin for him was the phantasy dead twin (Lewin, 2014.p.202). "A death of a twin especially for enmeshed twins can cause narcissistic injury to aspects of the self and are felt to be lost and gratifications brought to an end" (Case, 1993.p.18).

In the twin relationship, there can be a struggle for separateness but while in therapy it can be seen that the twin tries to protect the twinship. The struggle for separateness between enmeshed twins can be seen sometimes as life and death situations. Major ethical issues may arise in relation to one twin being in analysis and the affects this may have on the other twin not in analysis. Some twins may be able to negotiate this situation and work with the struggle of their own identity, whereas others may totally move away from it, taking refuge in the twinship (Lewin, 2014.p.163). This individual identity may be changing for one twin but may

have serious consequences for the twin not in treatment, separateness in one twin may be seriously damaging.

The implications of being a twin has been explored and identified in this chapter focusing on the two theories of identity and applying these to studies and observations of twins. Negotiating through infancy as a single child is difficult without having another always present, the bond and enmeshed twinship makes it impossible at times for the twins to separate and form their own identity. In particular identical twins find it difficult to even recognise their own image in the mirror and the impact this has on them. The author will progress on to chapter four concluding the thesis with particular attention to the other in the mirror for identical twin.

Chapter 4

Conclusion

This thesis aimed to investigate what it means to be a twin from a psychoanalytic perspective focusing on two main theorists Jacques Lacan and Melanie Klein and their theories on identity. Jacques Lacan's (1936) 'Mirror Stage' was his first major contribution to Psychoanalysis and along with Melanie Klein's 'paranoid schizoid and depressive position' they both majorly contributed to the understanding of identity in psychoanalysis (Bailly, 2009.p.28). Twins have provided fascination for many of us down the years, leading to many myths linked to the twinship or phantasy twin. Myths, as Lewin tells us, 'are symbolic representations of our experience as they move psychically from the more concrete objects of the paranoid-schizoid position towards the depressive position' (2014.p.29). Due to this fascination, people have created schemas for twins, labelling them as two parts of one or of a whole. This social reinforcement of the ego and identity fusion between the twins becomes internalized into identity. Splitting and creation of the double is central and the creation of these mythical twins is escalated in the process seen in twinning. Others who observe twins see it as a relationship in which they would to be in but in fact for twins it is a constant struggle for individuality, surrounded by rivalry, jealousy and fear. The twinship is the development of the infant's internal world and in particular the development of the relationship between twins. For singletons they develop this twinship in phantasy only then to diminish it but for twins the twinship is always there. This opens the question of the intense bond between twins and its effects on the identity of a twin. This twinship can cause them to become enmeshed identifying with each other as one.

Developing identity individuality and independence is an essential part of developing a healthy ego into adulthood. Finding identity for twins is complicate as the twins often define themselves as a unit, this oneness that is created by two. Lacan provides an understanding of mirroring and the infant's recognition in the mirror this mirror stage for the infant is in the imaginary. The mirror stage is the first time the infant begins to understand and represent itself it thinks of itself as "I" in relationship with an image in the mirror. Lacan stresses that images are very important to human development. The infant has a lack of sensory and motor

skills which results in a fragmented experience of the body. Lacan sees that the ego then comes as a reaction to this fragmented state of the body. The significance of reflections, mirroring, doubles and the gaze are part of our understanding of our internal world and have come incorporated into psychoanalytic thinking and identification (Lewin, 2014 p36). In relation to Lacan's (1936) the mirror stage he highlights the importance of both the gaze and mirror stage for the formation of identity and an understanding of the internal world. Burlingham (1952) was the first to note that dizygotic twins identify their mirror images before monozygotic ones. (Zazzo French psychologist was the first to study reactions of twins in the mirror). Alessandra Piontelli (1992) from foetus to child an observation and psychoanalytic study sees things are much more baffling and complex for identical twins.

This highlights the question of who is that other in the mirror for the twin? Are they seeing a fragmented image of their other twin as it takes them longer to recognise the mirror image as their own unlike single children or non-identical twins? Lacan's (1936) 'mirror stage' is the first time the infant begins to understand and represent itself it thinks of itself as "I" in relationship with an image in the mirror but what happens if they don't recognise this till three or later four years of age. Does this affect their sense of self as they identify with each other? Leonard (1961) discusses the idea that twins whom have a sense of oneness don't see themselves separated to their twin. This leaves them with the confrontation with the image in the mirror, this identification with their twin. This identification can continue through life and cause confusion in terms of identity and blurring of their self-image (Leonard, 1961.p.307).

The importance of siblings was highlighted by Freud (1909) and in Lacan's (1938) family complexes the intrusion complex is the experience in which the child has when they see another subject in which they have to share a relationship within the home. This is when the child realises that they have other siblings; "This jealousy at its most fundamental does not represent biological rivalry but rather a mental identification" (Lacan, 1938.p.33). The child through identification is committed to jealousy; the child either goes back to the maternal object and refuses the real, destroying the other or they are led to another object and they accept it (Lacan, 1938.p.33). Freud's (1909) case history 'phobia of a five year old boy' shows the implications of a sibling on little Hans and the implications on his psychosexual development after the birth of his sister Hannah. During the Oedipus complex the birth of a sibling reminds the child of an infidelity of the parent, the child's love object.

For Klein (1935) the depressive position is central in the child's early development the introjection of the object as a whole the infants object –relation change fundamentally. The love and hated part of the complete objects reinforces feelings of mourning and guilt which are extremely important in the infant's emotional and intellectual life; "The paranoid-schizoid position is linked with the death instinct and was a stage on position for the child these residues can remain and surface later in life" (Klein, 1935). The closeness that is felt between the twins may affect the early and later oedipal conflicts, causing lasting affects on the internal world of the twin. When the child accepts their parents as a couple that are not the same as the twin couple, then development towards the depressive position can proceed. There are many factors that contribute to the child's sense of self and their development of identity. Twins needs to negotiate the same emotional development as single children but they also have to deal with the fact of being a twin. The presence of a twin complicates and reflects common development phantasies of having a twin. The longing for a twin is related to the experience in relation to its mother. Klein (1963) suggests that this internal loneliness is due to wanting a perfect internal state and a phantasy twin provides the illusion of a perfect state. The early relationship with the mother is very much connected with the twinning process of twins; unlike a single infant, being a twin with the breast affects the development of the sense of self "identity" for the twins. They find it harder to differentiate their self from their twin, just like a single infant from its mother's breast (Klein, 1963:312). Piontelli (2002) discusses the fact that twins born into families with older siblings all siblings are disrupted by their arrival. However the younger siblings of twins seem to suffer even more. The competitiveness and fear of strivings can also have effect on the ego formation.

For Dorothy Burlingham (1945) a psychoanalyst and long term partner of Anna Freud suggested that being a twin is the "closet tie between two individuals" (2013). Her studies lead to the belief that twins enjoyed or suffered through an intimacy in their co-development, dependencies and emotional rapport. Mothers cannot connect to their twins until they get to know them apart from each other Piontelli's (1989) twin observations from foetus to child shows that single foetus individuality is present from the early stages and for twins too that are sharing a womb. It does not seem to affect the temperament of the twins but does have some affect in terms of pre-natal experiences. One thing that was very clear within these observations is that relating is established very early on within each twin; the case study of Mark and Celia showed this relation in a non-relating way as Mark turned away from his sister (Piontelli, 1989.p.425).

The death of a twin has major effects on both the parents and the other twin regardless of their relationship or age. The death of a twin does not free a twin from this twinship but adds more difficulties for them. The twin that has died may carry important projections that are linked to life, death and survival and these would be played out in the phantasies of the surviving twin. These phantasies are controlled by the twin and then tested in relation to external reality. This is seen in Piontelli (1989) observations that the infants have already established a relative relationship within the womb so if a twin dies before birth it still has major effects on the other twin. In the twin relationship there can be a struggle for separateness but while in therapy it can be seen when the twin attempts to protect the twinship. The struggle for separateness between enmeshed twins can be seen as sometimes life and death situations. Separation of twins can be problematic; when they are frustrated they sometimes use each other for gratification. This in return avoids the space for the development of symbolic thought which may be linked to the lack of symbolization in twins. There may be confusion of ego-boundaries causing a lack of separate sense of identity (Lewin, 2014 .p3-4). Major ethical issues may arise in relation to one twin being in analysis and the affects this may have on the other twin not in analysis. Some twins may be able to negotiate this situation and work with the struggle of their own identity, whereas other may totally move away from it taking refuge in the twinship (Lewin, 2014.p.163). This individual identity may be changing for one twin but may have serious consequences for the twin not in treatment, separateness in one twin may be seriously damaging.

The author comes to the conclusion that major importance should be considered in relation to the twinship and its effect on the twins. The child finds it harder to differentiate itself from the other twin just like the breast of the mother in early development. The child relates to the mother and the twin as primary objects especially when the mother is not present often gratifying each other. This lack of a separate sense of identity and confusion in relation of ego boundaries indicates the difficulties twins have separating themselves. The infants are negotiating the same emotional ties as a singleton within the depressive position, schizoid mechanisms and the mirror stage but also having to deal with being a twin. This twinship is the closest ties in which infants can have and has begun within the womb as they have already begun relating to each other. The importance of siblings has been discussed by Freud (1900) but when it comes to twins, the other siblings can become overly jealous of this closeness and in return, the twins can become jealous of the individuality of the singletons. The relationship with the mother is also clearly very important; some mothers find it hard to identify with their

twins and can be jealous of the attention that comes with having twins. They try to treat the twins as equal to stop rivalry but this in return stops individual treatment but some mothers want to treat them as a whole. Burlingham notes that some twins do not go on to develop different personalities and this could be due to the mother attitude towards the twins or the relationship the twins have (Lewin, 2014.p.66). Many delays are also evident in twins, in particular language, due to this unique twinship and the lack of individual communication. Often these twins don't communicate with each other as the twinship is strong enough where others may create their own language.

Twins and siblings have been neglected in psychoanalysis which highlights the importance of engaging in this topic for future research. It also brings about the ethical question in relation to the effects and implications of the twin who is not in analysis. It is evident that from the very beginning twins are constantly relating to each other hence, the strong twinship that develops. Twins are seen as magical and mythical but in reality they face many difficulties fighting for identity and individuality but always being pulled back into the twinship.

The thesis concludes with a question that needs to be researched further, the question of the other in the mirror and its implications of delayed identification for identical twins. What is the impact of this delayed identification as an interference with their ability to establish their own separate identity?

Bibliography

Balint, M. (1956). Pleasure Object and Libido. In M. Balint, *Problems of Human Pleasure and Behaviour*. (pp. 281-286). New York: Liveright.

Bion, W.R. (1962a) learning from experience. (p.19) *New York* 43: 306-10.

Burlingham, D.T. (1945)' the fantasy of having a twin. (p.205-210)' *Psychoanalytic study of the child* 1:205-10.

Burlingham D.T. (1952) twins: a study of three pairs of identical twins. London: imago.

Burlingham D.T. (1963) 'a study of identical twins – their analytic material compared with existing observation data of their early childhood.' *Psychoanalytic study of the child* 18: 367-423.

Bion, W.R. (1967) 'the imaginary twin.' In: W.R.Bion (1967) *second thoughts. Selected papers on psycho- analysis*. New York; Jason Aronson, (pp.3-22).

Carroll, L. (1871) *through the looking glass. The sequel to: Alice's adventures in wonderland*. Macmillian.UK.

Case, B.J. (1993) *living without your twin*. portland.tibbutt publishing.

Chodorow, N. J. (1999). *The Reproduction of Mothering; Psychoanalysis and the Sociology of Gender*. (Rev. Ed). Berkeley: University of California Press.

Freud, S. (1900). *The interpretation of dreams*. Standard Edition IV-V. The Hogarth Press, London.

Freud, S. (1909). *Two case Histories little Hans and The Rat man*. Vol X .Vintage. London.

Freud, S. Fleiss. W. (1889). *The Origins of Psychoanalysis: Letters to Wilhelm Fleiss, Drafts and Notes, 1887-1902*. England: Imago Publishing Company.

Freud, S. (1923) *The Ego and the Id*. In J. Strachey, the Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, Volume XIX, the Ego and the Id and other Works. (pp. 3-66). London: The Hogarth Press.

Freud, S. (1900). Fragment of an Analysis of a Case of Hysteria (“Dora”). In J. Strachey (Ed.), *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, a Case of Hysteria, Three Essays on Sexuality and Other Works*. (pp. 7-122). London: Hogarth Press.

Freud, S. (1905) *Three Essays on the Theory of Sexuality*. New York: Perseus Books.

Freud, S. (1915). Instinct and their Vicissitudes. In J. Strachey (Ed and Trans), *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, Volume xiv (1914-1916) On the History of the Psycho-Analytic movement, Papers on Metapsychology and Other Works*. (pp. 109-140). London: The Hogarth Press and the Institute of Psychoanalysis.

Freud, S. (1915-1916) *Introductory Lectures on Psycho-analysis, Parts I and II*. Strachey, J. (Ed). *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, New Introductory Lectures on Psychoanalysis and Other Works Volume XV (1915-1916)*. (pp. 1-240). London: The Hogarth Press and the Institute of Psychoanalysis.

Freud, S. (1915-1916) *General Theory of the Neuroses, Parts III*. Strachey, J. (Ed). *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, New Introductory Lectures on Psychoanalysis and Other Works, Volume XVI (1915-1916)*. (pp. 241-463). London: The Hogarth Press and the Institute of Psychoanalysis.

Freud, S. (1917). *Mourning and Melancholia*. In J. Strachey (Ed and Trans), *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, Volume xiv (1914-1916) On the History of the Psycho-Analytic Movement, Papers on Metapsychology and Other Works*. (pp. 237-258). London: The Hogarth Press and the Institute of Psychoanalysis.

Freud, S. (1918). *From A History of Infantile Neurosis*. In S, Freud, *Three Case Histories: ‘the Wolf Man’, ‘the Ratman’ and the Psychotic Doctor Schreber*. (pp 161-168). New York: Simon and Schuster.

Freud, S. (1919) ‘*A Child Is Being Beaten*’ A Contribution to the Study of the Origin of Sexual Perversions. In Strachey, J. (Ed). *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, Volume xvii, (1917-1919): An Infantile Neurosis and Other Works*. (pp. 175-204). London: The Hogarth Press and the Institute of Psychoanalysis.

Freud, S. (1920). Beyond the Pleasure Principle. In S. Freud, The Standard Edition of the complete psychological works of Sigmund Freud, Volume xviii (1920-1922). (pp. 1-64). London: Hogarth Press.

Freud, S. (1920) Fear and Anxiety. In A General Introduction to Psychoanalysis. (p. 340-354). New York: Boni and Liveright

Freud, S. (1920). Beyond the Pleasure Principle. In J. Strachey (Ed), On Metapsychology - the Theory of Psychoanalysis Volume 11. (pp. 269-388) London: Pelican Freud Library.

Graves R. (1992) The Greek myths. Combined edition. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.

Jones, E. (1953-1957) 'the life and work of Sigmund Freud. New York. Basic Books.

Klein, M. (1927). Symposium on Child-analysis. In: Love, guilt and reparation and other works 1921-1945. London: Virago Press

Klein, M. (1928). Early Stages of the Oedipus Conflict and of Super Ego Formation. In Klein, M. The Psychoanalysis of Children: Volume 2 of the Works of Melanie Klein. (pp. 123-148). New York: Free Press.

Klein, M. (1937). Love, guilt and reparation. In: Love, guilt and reparation and other works 1921-1945. London: Virago Press.

Klein, M. (1945). The Oedipus complex in the light of early anxieties. In: Steiner, J. (ed.). The Oedipus complex today. Clinical implications. London: Karnac Books.

Klein, M. (1946). Notes on Some Schizoid Mechanisms. In P, Heimann, S, Isaacs, M. Klein & J, Riviere (Eds). Developments in Psychoanalysis. (pp. 292-320). London: Karnac Books.

Klein, M. (1946). The Psychoanalysis of Children: Volume 2 of the Writings of Melanie Klein. New York: Free Press.

Klein, M. (1952). Some Theoretical Conclusions Regarding the Emotional Life of the Infant. In P. Heimann, S. Isaacs, M. Klein & J. Riviere (Eds). Developments in Psychoanalysis. (pp. 198-236). London: Karnac Books.

Klein, M., Heimann, P., Money-Kyrle, R. (eds. (1955). New Directions in Psycho-Analysis. The Significance of Infant Conflict in the Pattern of Adult Behaviour. London: Tavistock Publications.

Klein, M. (1963) 'on the sense of loneliness.' In: *Envy and Gratitude and other works*. London: Hogarth press (1980).

Klein, M. (1975) *Love, Guilt and Reparation and Other Works 1921-1945*. (p.173, 327). New York: Dell.

Lacan, J. (1938). *Family complexes in the formation of the individual*. Paris: a.de monzie (translated by Cormac Gallagher).

Lacan, J (1961-1962) *the seminar of Jacques Lacan identification*. (Book I.X) Translated by Cormac Gallagher. 7th November 2011. Lacaninireland.

Lacan, J. (2001) *Ecrits* translated by Alan Sheridan. (P1-9) Routledge. London.

Lewin, V. (2014) *the twin in the transference*. (p.9-49) Karnac. London.

Leonard, M. (1961) 'problems in identification and ego development in twins'. *Psychoanalytic study of the child* 16:300-320.

Metzler, D. (1998) 'the kleinian development'. (P.33-34). London. Karnac.

Mitchell, J. (2000). *Mad men and medusas. Reclaiming hysteria and the effects of sibling relations on the human condition*. New York: Allen Lane. The Penguin Press.

Pines, M. (1984) *Reflections on mirroring*. *International review of psychoanalysis* 11:27-42.

Piontelli, A. (2002) *twins: from foetus to child*. London and New York: Routledge.

Piontelli, A. (1989) 'a study on twins before or after birth.' *International review of psychoanalysis* 16:413-26

Rosner, S. (1985) *on the place of siblings in Psychoanalysis*. (vol.72 (3), p457). *Psychoanalytic review* Connecticut, Psychological association.

Scharff, D. E. (Ed.). (1996). *Object Relations Theory & Practice: An Introduction*. United States: J. Aronson.

Segal, H. (2012). *The Paranoid Schizoid Position*. In H. Segal, *Introduction to the Work of Melanie Klein*. (pp. 24-38). London: Karnac Books.

Segal, J. (2004). *Melanie Klein: Key Figures in Counselling and Psychotherapy*(p.33):
Second Edition. California: Sage.

Steiner, J. (1993) *psychic retreats.pathological organisations in psychotic, neurotic and
borderline patients*. London: Routledge

Tustin, F. (1972) *Autism and Childhood Psychosis*. (177-178). London: Hogarth.